

January 24, 2014

Dr. Thomas Frieden
Director
Centers for Disease Control and Prevention
1600 Clifton Road
Atlanta, GA 30333

The Honorable Gina McCarthy
Administrator
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20460

Dear Director Frieden and Administrator McCarthy:

As West Virginia scientists and health professionals, we are writing to urge you to remove barriers that prevent agency scientists from sharing their expertise with the public.

On January 9, an unknown amount of 4-methylcyclohexanemethanol leaked from tanks at a Freedom Industries facility into the Elk River, just upstream from a treatment plant that provides water for 300,000 West Virginians. Since then, our communities have suffered with inadequate, and sometimes conflicting, information about both long term and short term risks of exposure to the chemical.¹

Part of the problem is that too little is known about this (and many other) chemicals that are used in industrial processes. Tens of thousands of chemicals in use today have never been evaluated by the EPA or any other government agency.²

That said, your agencies have repeatedly failed to adequately respond to questions from the public and the press.³ We deserve to be told what is known--and what is not known-- about the risks the chemical poses to human health as the disaster unfolds. If the government had been more forthcoming about what is not known about the leaked chemicals, citizens and local officials would have been able to make better choices about the actions needed to protect their families and communities. Some may have chosen to leave the area, others to make longer-term arrangements for alternative sources of water. Only an informed citizenry can make informed choices.

Unfortunately, government scientists have been notably absent from the public discussion. Both the Environmental Protection Agency and the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention refused repeated interview requests for nearly a week.⁴ Further, CDC officials consistently failed to explain how the agency had arrived at a one-part-per-million threshold for the water to be considered safe.⁵ This is especially troubling in light of recent commitments by both of your agencies to transparency and accountability through developing and fully implementing policies that support scientific integrity and openness. Lack of access to government scientists can only lead to less trust in your agencies and more harm to the citizens of West Virginia.

Government scientists should be able to share their expertise with the public and the press without interference from other agency staff. While public affairs officers can play a coordinating role and should

¹ Ward Jr., Ken. "Use of water 'your decision,' Tomblin says." [Charleston Gazette](#), January 20, 2014.

² "What is TSCA?" Safer Chemicals Healthy Families. Available at www.saferchemicals.org/resources/tsca.html. Accessed January 21, 2014.

³ Ward Jr., Ken. "CDC: W.Va. water crisis 'a dynamic and evolving event'." [Charleston Gazette](#), January 16, 2014.

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ Ward, Jr., Ken. "Experts: Not enough data to judge MCHM dangers." [Charleston Gazette](#), January 17, 2014.

be kept aware of scientists' public statements, they should not act as gatekeepers that compromise our ability to understand the potential risks we are facing. This is especially true during emergency situations, when better access to scientific information can help prevent exposure and injury.

As scientists ourselves, we are particularly aware that our colleagues who work for the federal government can be a tremendous resource--but not if they are restricted from communicating with the public. We urge you to update your policies and practices to allow unfettered access to the scientists whose expertise can help prevent illness and injury. Our communities and our fellow citizens deserve no less.

Sincerely,

John W. Aldis
Retired Physician
Shepherdstown, WV
M.D., Medicine; M.P.H., Public Health and Tropical Medicine

Joseph L. Allen
Professor, Department of Geology
Chair, Division of Science, Mathematics, & Health
Concord University
Athens, WV
Ph.D., Geology

Tina J. Cartwright
Associate Professor, College of Education & Professional Development
Marshall University
Huntington, WV
Ph.D., Meteorology

James Culberson
Professor, Department of Neurobiology and Anatomy
West Virginia University
Morgantown, WV
Ph.D., Human Anatomy, Neurobiology

Frank S. Gilliam
Professor, Department of Biological Sciences
Marshall University
Huntington, WV
Ph.D., Ecology

Frank D. Gmeindl
Retired Engineer
Morgantown, WV
M.S., Physics; M.S., Mechanical Engineering; M.B.A., Business Administration

John E. Hall
Professor Emeritus, Department of Microbiology, Immunology and Cell Biology
West Virginia University School of Medicine
Morgantown, WV
Ph.D., Biology

William Hicks
Professor, Department of Biology
Bethany College
Bethany, WV
Ph.D., Forest Science

Sarah S. Knox
Professor, Department of Epidemiology
West Virginia University
Morgantown, WV
Ph.D., Epidemiology

James Kotcon
Associate Professor, Division of Plant and Soil Sciences
West Virginia University
Morgantown, WV
Ph.D., Plant Pathology

Stephen C. Kuehn
Assistant Professor, Department of Physical Science
Concord University
Athens, WV
Ph.D., Geology

Marianne Mannix
Division of Plant & Soil Sciences
West Virginia University
Morgantown, WV
M.S. Candidate, Soil Science

Jeffrey D. May
Professor, Department of Biological Sciences
Marshall University
Huntington, WV
Ph.D., Forest Ecology

Laura Merner
Student, University of Maryland
Blair, WV
Ph.D. Candidate, Geography and Environmental Systems

John C. Nemeth
President, Education and Research Consulting, CGJC Enterprises and Associates
Christiansburg, WV
Ph.D., Ecology

John P. Raney
Retired Scientist
NASA Langley Research Center
Oak Hill, WV
Ph.D., Engineering

G. Paul Richter
Emeritus Professor, Department of Chemistry
West Virginia Wesleyan College
Buckhannon, WV
Ph. D., Inorganic Chemistry

Jane F. Rissler
Retired Scientist
Charles Town, WV
Ph.D., Agriculture

Edward S. Saugstad
Retired Scientist
Sinks Grove, WV
M.S., Entomology

Richard B. Thomas
Professor, Department of Biology
West Virginia University
Morgantown, WV
Ph.D., Forest Ecology

Hope M. Tiesman
Research Epidemiologist
National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health
Morgantown, WV
Ph.D., Epidemiology

Richard P. Treat
Professor Emeritus, Department of Physics and Astronomy
West Virginia University
Morgantown, WV
Ph.D., Physical Science

Paul E. Wilson, Jr.
Retired Wildlife Biologist
Charles Town, WV
M.S., Wildlife Ecology

Nicolas Zegre
Assistant Professor, Forest Hydrology
West Virginia University
Morgantown, WV
Ph.D., Hydrology, Water Resources

CC:

Shawn Garvin, EPA Region 3 Administrator
Llelwyn Grant, CDC New Media Branch Chief
Francesca Grifo, Ph.D., EPA Scientific Integrity Chief
Donna Heron, EPA Acting Region 3 PIO
Harold Jaffe, M.D., CDC Associate Director for Science
Alisha Johnson, EPA Press Secretary
Ron Otten, Ph.D., Director of the CDC Office of Scientific Integrity
Barbara Reynolds, Ph.D., CDC Division of Public Affairs Director
Tom Reynolds, EPA Associate Administrator for External Affairs and Environmental Education
Glenn Paulson, Ph.D., EPA Science Advisor